

OFFICIAL MINUTES OF THE MEETING
GOODLETTSVILLE PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION

October 7, 2019
5:00 p.m.

Goodlettsville City Hall
Massie Chambers

Present: Chairman Tony Espinosa, Vice-Chairman Jim Galbreath, Scott Trew, Jim Hitt, Mayor Jeff Duncan, David Lynn, Judy Wheeler, Vice-Mayor Rusty Tinnin, Grady McNeal

Absent: Bob Whitaker, Jerry Garrett

Also Present: Addam McCormick, Russell Freeman, Mike Bauer, Tim Ellis, Mary Laine Hucks, Kimberley Lynn, Greg Edrington, and others.

Chairman Espinosa called the meeting to order.

Staff discussed that the Echo Hills Construction plans items were removed from the originally advertised agenda.

Jim Hitt made a motion to approve the agenda as amended. David Lynn seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously 9-0.

With no additions or corrections, David Lynn made a motion to approve the minutes of the September 9, 2019 meeting. Jim Galbreath seconded the motion. Motion approved 6-0. Judy Wheeler, Vice-Mayor Rusty Tinnin, and Grady McNeal abstained since they were absent at the September 9th meeting.

ITEM#1

Parkview Preserve Phase Two (2)/Ragan Smith Associates: Requests final subdivision plat approval for seven (7) single family lots and seventy-eight (78) townhomes lots on 39.83 acres located on French Street and Harris Street. Properties referenced as Davidson County Tax Map/Parcels 0250005800 and 02508008500 and are zoned MDRPUD, Medium Density Residential Planned Unit Development. Property Owner- Parkview Preserve Holding, LP. (9.1 #06-19)

Lynn Ealey, Project Representative

Staff Discussion Items:

- Revised plans complied with staff review comments
- Proposal includes final phase and connection to Harris Street
- Improvement cost spreadsheet for bonding- Public Works has questions about asphalt costs and staff will work with developer

Planning Commission Discussion Items:

- Vice-Chairman Jim Galbreath asked if bond was already in place
- Staff stated no, but it would be prior to this plat being presented to be recorded

Motion: Mayor Jeff Duncan made a motion to approve, Grady McNeal seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously 9-0.

ITEM#2

The Hill Place/L. Steven Bridges Land Surveying and Consulting: Requests recommendation to the City Commission for an amendment to the final master plan for six (6) additional units in the existing buildings on Old Brick Church Pike. Properties referenced as Davidson County Tax Map/Parcels 018160A1100CO-1600CO and are zoned HDRPUD, High Density Residential Planned Unit Development. Property Owner- GMAC Properties, LLC

Mark Writesman, Project Representative

Staff Discussion Items:

- Proposal is to covert six (6) first level vacant areas to residential units
- Buildings twenty (20+) years old
- Current parking has three (3) spaces per unit
- Current 20 units/7.28 acres- proposal 26 units/7.28 acres equals 3.6 units per acre
- HRDPUD zoning permits 7.0 units per acre
- Developer discussed adding sidewalks and additional parking
- Code improvements required to convert to residential use
- Staff stipulation of staff administering parking and sidewalk minor improvements without coming to Planning Commission

Planning Commission Discussion Items:

- Jim Hitt asked what use of space has been- storage.
- Mark Writesman stated the spaces are vacant
- Vice-Mayor Tinnin stated the project is a nice project

Motion: Vice-Mayor Rusty Tinnin made a motion to approve with staff stipulation, Grady McNeal seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously 9-0.

ITEM#3

Cartwright Street Hotel and Convention Center, Rhodes Engineering and Environmental Services: Requests site landscaping and lighting plan approval for a Hotel and Convention Center on Cartwright Street and East Cedar Street, Properties referenced as Davidson County Tax Map/Parcels-. 01913010300, 01913007400, 01913009700 and 01913009800 containing 4.84-acres. Property zoning- CS, Commercial Services, CCO, Commercial Core Overlay, and INT, Interchange Overly District. Property Owner- Unique Omega, LLC (9.1 #05-19)

Deal Patel, Project Representative

Staff Discussion Items:

- Last month Planning Commission conditionally approved plans
- Conditional approval required lighting, landscaping, and building exterior plans to be reviewed and approved by Planning Commission- staff review and approve other revisions
- Revised drainage calculations have been submitted and staff is currently reviewing
- Discussion of staff stipulations items:
 - Stipulation Item#1 Plans show 57" caliper inches- landscape architect concerned with additional plantings in creek/floodway area- already multiple plantings proposed
 - Stipulation Item#2- Courtyard area and along walks to include pole or building wall type lighting
 - Stipulation Item#3- Conflicting tree and parking lot lighting locations need to be revised

Planning Commission Discussion Items:

- Scott Trew asked if city allowed a tree bank to allow required plantings to be completed on city property instead in cases like this
- Staff stated no- but could be an option if owner agrees
- Dean Patel stated he would be ok with that as an alternative to additional plantings on-site
- Tim Ellis, City Manager stated that project includes a section of sidewalk built to meet commercial core greenway section
- Dean Patel agreed with statement
- Vice Chairman Jim Galbreath asked Greg Edrington, City Engineer if storm water/drainage items completed
- Greg Edrington stated calculations have been received and review and approval still outstanding
- Chairman Tony Espinosa stated the staff stipulations and what the motion would need to include an option for tree bank to support city greenway as an alternative to planting the 57" additional caliper inches on the property.
- Scott Trew confirmed tree bank alternative could be used on any city property

Motion: Scott Trew made a motion to approve with staff stipulations and Judy Wheeler seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously 9-0.

ITEM#4

William Hall Lots Long Hollow Pike/Cindy Toby: Requests alternative building material percentage requirements for a single family home in a LDRPUD, Low Density Residential Planned Unit Development zoning district. Property referenced as Sumner County Tax Map/Parcel 143 – 22.04 and William Hall Lots Subdivision Plat lot one.

Cindy Toby, Property Representative

Staff Discussion Items:

- Owner proposal is for 1,200 to 1,300 sq. ft. house with hardi-board type siding and brick foundation or split face blocking foundation
- Staff discussed property zoned LDRPUD, Low Density Residential Planned Unit Development but the zoning did not include a master plan
- This property was subdivided in 2008 for two (2) new lots off Long Hollow Pike the third lot contains an existing house
- Staff explained location of proposed house would be behind ditch up-hill but owner corrected in would be between ditch and Long Hollow Pike on lot one not lot 2 area
- Staff discussed the PUD districts require buildings to be 50% brick or stone with remainder of area hardi-board type, split face block, EIFS stucco type material
- Staff discussed in base residential zoning districts require minimum garage construction but not material requirement and PUD does not require a garage but does include minimum material requirements
- Staff discussed with owner possible rezoning to a base residential zoning but it could be considered spot zoning since would be surrounded by PUD zoning
- Staff discussed a similar request was approved with Parkview Preserve development on French Street with primary hardi-board type siding with twenty-five (25%) percent brick or stone on front walls

Planning Commission Discussion Items:

- Cindy Toby and Commission discussed house location would be similar to adjacent brick home moved on the property a few years ago
- Vice-Mayor Rusty Tinnin asked about height of foundation
- Cindy Toby and Staff discussed three (3+) plus feet
- Staff discussed foundation would be ten (10%) to fifteen (15%) percent of total house
- Jim Hitt asked about garage proposal
- Cindy Toby stated a garage is possible depending on project costs
- Jim Hitt asked about design of house
- Cindy Toby went out to car and brought back plans to present
- Mayor Jeff Duncan asked if any private covenants applicable to the property
- Cindy Toby answered no
- Mayor Jeff Duncan asked about flood plain shown on plat
- Staff discussed with flood elevation process surveyor found plat no longer correct – ditch portion of property not in a 100 year flood plain but now a 500year non-regulated area but house proposed location would still be outside this area

- Mayor Jeff Duncan discussed being able to see both sides of proposal since it is a PUD zoning but only a two (2) lot subdivision not a development and if the similar project was not zoned PUD say R25, Low Density Residential this would not even be an issue
- Mayor Jeff Duncan discussed if the proposal was in a base zoning district the house size would be bigger with an attached garage
- Mayor Jeff Duncan questioned if one level ranch design would match area and house in neighborhood and the similar R25 zoning would require a larger house.
- Judy Wheeler asked about zoning of original proposal
- Scott Trew discussed proposal and asked owner about proposal
- Cindy Toby stated proposed sq. ft. of 1,214 and split face block was due to cost and her desire to have a smaller home
- Vice-Chairman Galbreath stated that per the subdivision plat the LDRPUD zoning was in place when the property was subdivided in 2007
- Chairman Tony Espinosa discussed the alternative building material request and asked for a motion
- Scott Trew asked how soon is owner wanting to proceed and if revised plans could be brought back for review
- Cindy Toby stated quickly wanting to permit and start
- Staff discussed proposal and if denied would require building to include 50% brick or stone and the remainder could be hardi type board siding and that no rezoning proposed tonight and following R25 zoning regulations would require a rezoning
- Jim Hitt- discussed not proper on Long Hollow Pike fast growing area of city and the request would not be growing in the right way
- Chairman Tony Espinosa stated would have to vote against didn't have answers in other areas.

Motion: Mayor Jeff Duncan made a motion to approve, Scott Trew seconded the motion. Vote- Mayor Jeff Duncan, Scott Trew, and David Lynn for and Judy Wheeler, Grady McNeal, Vice-Mayor Rusty Tinnin, Chairman Tony Espinosa, Vice-Chairman Jim Galbreath, and Jim Hitt against. Motion denied 3-6.

ITEM#5

Domino's Pizza/ Business Owner: Requests administrative appeal regarding Planning Staff requirement to reduce the primary color wall coverage percentage at 322 Long Hollow Pike, Suite 101 per the provisions of the Goodlettsville Design Guidelines. Property is referenced as Davidson County Tax Map Parcel 01900002000 and is zoned CSL, Commercial Services Limited. Property Owner- The Northgate Investment Trust.

Jeff Richards, Business Representative

Staff Discussion Items:

- Wall signage ok per sign ordinance including window signs
- Issue is percentage of wall area with primary blue color window decals
- Maximum per design guidelines is fifteen (15%) primary colors- they have twenty-three (23%) percent.
- Window decals for sun glare and screening office area

Planning Commission Discussion Items:

- Jeff Richards discussed that he was representing the franchise owner and the purpose of the window decals and blue color
- Decals are used to screen the manager's office and cooler area- areas public does not need to see
- Provided pictures from inside store showing screening
- Jim Hitt discussed other ideas rather than window decals- representative discussed
- Chairman Tony Espinosa asked if door was a public door shown on the front facing Long Hollow and can understand the reason for the blue decals
- Jeff Richards stated it was just a walk up door
- Staff discussed area over is about fifty (50) sq. ft. in area different options to alter windows
- Scott Trew said he personally does not have a problem with the looks of the business and it would look odd using different colors unless they changed the whole design
- Mayor Jeff Duncan discussed KFC and colors
- Staff discussed the issues with KFC colors was the reason the Planning Commission voted to change the design guidelines to create a defined percentage permitted instead of previous standards allowing primary colors as an accent only.

Motion: Scott Trew made a motion to approve, David Lynn seconded the motion. Vote for approval- Mayor Jeff Duncan, Scott Trew, David Lynn, Jim Hitt Chairman Tony Espinosa, Grady McNeal, Vice-Mayor Rusty Tinnin. Chairman Jim Galbreath, and Judy Wheeler voted against. Motion passed approved 7-2

ITEM#6

Right-of-Way Closure- Planning Staff: Requests recommendation to the City Commission to close two (2) sections of non-improved ten (10') feet alleyway right-of-ways per the W.B Myers Home Place Subdivision Plat and designate the right-of-way area to the adjacent property owners.

Staff Discussion Items:

- Old 1920s alleyway right-of-way non-improved
- Closing would require city to survey and split right-of-way area to all adjacent properties
- Tree fell in right-of-way area- residents question who is responsible for cleaning up in non-improved right-of-way areas

Planning Commission Discussion Items:

- Mayor Jeff Duncan wants staff to confirm the alleyway right-of-ways are not used for any utilities or trash service- if not, ok to close the right-of-ways

Motion: David Lynn made a motion to approve, Jim Hitt seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously approved 9-0

ITEM#7

Zoning Ordinance Amendment-Planning Staff: Requests recommendation to the City Commission to amend the Zoning Ordinance Sections 14-203 Commercial District Regulations (5) Other Regulations (b) Special height provisions applicable within the CC,

CS and commercial planned development districts to include defined districts and requirements for increased building height of seven (7) stories for all commercial zoning districts adjacent to the I-65 interchanges.

Staff Discussion Items:

- Basis for additional stories connected to visibility from interstate and interchanges – same as interstate sign district that permits larger sixty (60) feet sign heights
- Planning Commission could also review properties adjacent to interstate sign district like property on North Cartwright Street
- Proposed amendment gives review authority to Planning Commission
- Applicants must provide information regarding water availability and access for fire equipment
- Zoning ordinance currently allows seven (7) stories in two zoning districts
- Proposal includes removal of an existing special height requirements but proposal requires information submitted to Planning Commission include air and sun light access to adjacent properties

Motion: Judy Wheeler made a motion to approve, Vice-Mayor Rusty Tinnin seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously approved 9-0

ITEM#8

Zoning Ordinance Amendment- Planning Staff: Requests recommendation to the City Commission to amend the Zoning Ordinance Section 14-304 Signs in Residential and Agricultural Districts and Section 14-305 Signs in Commercial and Industrial Districts to define consistent minimum pole and ground sign setbacks of five (5') to twenty (20') based on the height of the pole or ground signs.

Staff Discussion Items:

- Zoning Ordinance includes multiple setback requirements- proposal is for simple application
- Proposed setbacks of five (5') to twenty (20') feet based on sign height and area not just zoning
- City approved ordinance a few years ago for reduced setbacks for small signs in commercial core/town center area
- Reduced setbacks for smaller signs better align with landscaping and site design

Planning Commission Items:

- Mayor Jeff Duncan proposal would be similar to political signs more simple application for enforcement

Motion: Grady McNeal made a motion to approve, Judy Wheeler seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously approved 9-0

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Animal Day Care Facility-

Staff stated no one present to speak –will hold until someone makes the request

Secondary Residential Dwelling Units-

Staff discussed request from two (2) residents on larger acreage properties

Staff discussed ordinance examples from other cities

Staff stated any Goodlettsville ordinance would include a regulation that they could not be used for a short term rental

Planning Commissioners discussed if three (3) to five (5) acres would qualify as large enough property for these and concerned of building being rented could be positive but want to consider it first before reviewing any amendments

-Commissioners discussed deed restrictions and how they would apply with this use in the future

Public Forum on Planning Related Topics

No one came forward to speak

Judy Wheeler made a motion made to close public forum, seconded by Vice-Mayor Rusty Tinnin. All in favor to close public forum

With no further business, the meeting adjourned at 6:28 pm.

Tony Espinosa, Chairman



Addam McCormick, Planning Director