OFFICIAL MINUTES OF THE MEETING
GOODLETTSVILLE PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION

November 7, 2016

Goodlettsville City Hall
Massie Chambers

Present: Chairman Jim Galbreath, Vice Chairman Jim Driver, Mayor John Coombs, Grady McNeal, Jim Hitt, Scott Trew, Tony Espinosa, Jerry Garrett, Commissioner Jeff Duncan, David Lynn, Bob Whittaker
Absent: All Present
Also Present: Addam McCormick, Commissioner Zach Young, Jeff McCormick, Mike Bauer, Greg Edrington, Rhonda Carson and others

Chairman Jim Galbreath called the meeting to order and noted a change from the original published agenda. He stated Item #6 on the published agenda was deleted. Chairman Galbreath also suggested moving item #8 up to the beginning of the agenda to accommodate Citizen Ms. Harris. Ms. Harris was not present at the time. Chairman Galbreath stated if she came to the meeting, item #8 could be moved up. With no objection to the agenda changes, the agenda was modified as Chairman directed. Addam McCormick clarified that deleted item #6 of the published agenda was Denham & Blythe and the agenda before the Planning Commission members showed those changes. Mayor Coombs offered prayer.

Minutes of the October 3, 2016 Planning and Zoning Commission minutes stand approved as written.

Item #1 ***Wade Circle Office Retail Center/Klober Engineering Services:*** Requests site plan approval for 5,000 square feet commercial building at 620 Wade Circle. Property is zoned CSL, Commercial Services Limited. Property is referenced as Davidson County Tax Map/Parcel 02610000700 and contains 0.64 acres. Property Owners: Horace and Betty Henley. (9.1-14-16)

Josh Lyon represented Klober Engineering Services. Staff reviewed. Addam McCormick stated the request is for a 5,000 sq. ft. commercial building and parking area on an undeveloped lot on Wade Circle. He explained that the property includes portions of two old properties from the 1940's subdivision plat. The surveyor will need to plat them as one to prevent any issues with the old lot line. Mr. McCormick discussed the surrounding properties of Wade Circle. All of the properties are zoned CSL, Commercial Services Limited, and the area has multiple existing legal non-conforming single family residential uses. Mr. McCormick stated that lighting and site development (landscaping) of the property would need to be taken into account regarding the adjacent residential homes. Mr. McCormick discussed two things the applicant requested a variance from design standards:

1. The site plan includes a new sidewalk section along Wade Circle. Due to the slope of the drive and limitations of the property, the applicant requested a design standard variance from the sidewalk connection between the building sidewalk and the Wade Circle sidewalk. Ramp kick-backs would be required and due to limited property dimensions and grade which dictates the storm water detention pond location to the front of the project, the site contains limitations to an ADA compliant connection.
2. Applicant also requested to obtain a variance from the building foundation planter requirement along the front of the building due to limited areas available due to slopes and limited property dimensions.

Addam McCormick discussed the proposed building design. The plan showed an all brick building except for the rear of the building wall being split face which will not be visible from the street and within the design guidelines of the City. He stated it will be a quality building and a great addition to the area.

Chairman Galbreath asked John Lyon with Klober Engineering Services if he understood and agreed to Staff comments. Mr. Lyon stated that they would work with Staff to accommodate the stipulations presented. Mr. Lyon stated that concerning the grade change, they have a substantial retaining wall on the back and have used every inch on this site to fit everything in.
Mayor Coombs stated he was glad to see this proposed project on Wade Circle. He asked Staff to survey the street lighting of Wade Circle and see if the City has adequate lighting for this area. City Engineer Greg Edrington and Josh Lyon discussed the retaining wall design. Mr. Grady McNeal and Mr. Lyon discussed irrigation of the site and single slope roof design.
Based on Staff report, and discussion had at the meeting, Mr. Jim Driver made a motion to conditionally approve the request based on the following items:

1. Additional Wall light information to ensure the wall lighting intensity does not exceed city requirements
2. Additional landscaping at the east end of the parking aisle to screen vehicle headlights.
3. Minor final subdivision plat to be completed to delete the lot line of the existing lots.
4. Variance of pedestrian walks/ramps
5. Variance of front building foundation planter strip

Mr. Jim Hitt seconded the motion. The motion passed 11-0.

Item #2 *Best Western Plus/J & S Construction and Thomsen Engineering:* Request site plan approval for a 57,549 square feet/eighty-eight (88) unit hotel project on Conference Drive adjacent to the Lennox Place Apartments. The request requires a variance for a plan unit development project regarding the minimum number of hotel rooms. Property is zoned GOPUD, General Office Planned Unit Development. Property is referenced as Davidson County Tax Map/Parcel 02600010300 and contains 2.85 acres. Property Owner: Shiv Sai Hospitality Group Inc.

Ryan Williams represented J & S Construction and Thomsen Engineering. Staff reviewed. Addam McCormick reminded the Board members that The Planning Commission and City Commission on first reading approved a zoning ordinance amendment that would delete hotels in the GOPUD, General Office Planned Unit Development Zoning Ordinance. The second reading of the ordinance amendment has been placed on hold to allow the property owner to submit plans for this hotel since the property owner's process started before the ordinance amendment process.
Mr. McCormick stated the applicant has requested a two stage site development approval process with the applicant coming back next month to submit lighting and landscaping plans. Mr. McCormick sated the revised plan had just been submitted and he would cover the highlights and the remaining items could be stipulations.
Staff addressed the Planning Commission, concerning the proposed site plan. Fire access was an issue with the four story hotel having only one access point, and the entrance being very steep. The Fire Chief has requested that the main entrance driving width be enlarged to 26 feet, to accommodate the fire department ladder truck. A second request had been made to allow fire department access to the southeast corner of the building, by a ladder truck. An additional request for a secondary entrance point could be made at the rear of the property, from the adjacent Piccadilly Apartment complex with some type of fire department only access gate that would stay locked.

Ryan Williams representing J & S Construction addressed the Planning Commission and directed them to drawing A100, which showed a new 26' fire lane by the side canopy of the building. Mr. Williams stated that he spoke to the Fire Chief about access to the southeast corner of the building. Mr. Williams stated that currently on the south side of the building, they have a 2 ½ foot tall retaining wall proposed in this area. To allow for a fire truck to be able to pull into an area on this side of the building, the retaining wall will have to be moved, and enlarged to a height of 12 feet, and they would lose two parking spaces. Mr. Williams stated they could remove one parking space by the dumpster, but questioned how far back did

the access drive need to go? Will it need to go 30 feet or the entire back side of the building? Mr. Williams also stated that the back of the property narrowed considerably, and due to the steep topography, the second access point from the Piccadilly Apartment complex would not be a viable proposal.

Staff continued with the comments concerning the entrance slope to the front of the property which is an 8.5% running slope. Staff advised that this was within the 10% maximum slope requirement for a fire department access road. ADA sidewalk access to the site will be a concern, due to the steepness of the site. Staff advised that it will be important to be able to move people from the public sidewalk onto the site and still meet the ADA requirements. Staff advised that on this site, the sidewalk will be on an angle to meet the slope requirements. Mr. Williams advised that the sidewalk would be within the 5% slope requirements so as to not require any handrails or landings to be installed.

Staff discussed the next issue of drainage on the site. Staff advised that he and the City Engineer walked the site to see what was on the adjacent properties. Previous projects in this area had drainage designs that resulted from TDOT requirements when the roadway was widened. Greg Edrington (City Engineer) addressed the Planning Commission about the proposed site drainage plan. He stated that they came back with an increase in the detention pond capacity, to allow for a decrease in the impact the site drainage will have on the adjacent catch basin, located at Lennox Gate Apartments. He stated that they added additional overflow to the island swale area in the rear of the property, to handle the infiltration purposes for clean water runoff. Mr. Edrington advised that it appears based on a limited review at the meeting that they have complied with the staff requests on the drainage issues.

Staff presented the exterior elevations to the Planning Commission members. Staff advised that due to the narrowness of the lot, the building had to be turned sideways. The designer made some changes to the side of the building facing the Conference Drive to make it more appealing from the street. This side is covered in stone that is well over the percentage required by the design standards.

Staff advised that this will be a two part approval process. Staff will have to confirm with the Fire Chief their approval of the revised details, concerning access to the southeast corner of the building. Staff is looking to the Commission Members to consider decrease in rooms from 90 rooms, to 88 rooms, and a decrease in parking spaces from 106, down to 93 spaces.

Chairman Galbreath requested information on the three retention ponds on the site labeled as vegetation/bio ponds. Chairman Galbreath asked Commissioner Duncan about the pond which is located closest to Conference Drive, and the design of the head wall. Commissioner Duncan advised that these structures are designed this way to allow the water to be released at a controlled rate. Chairman Galbreath pointed out that the roof drains are currently designed to run into the middle retention pond and he did not see an outlet for the middle retention pond to release its water. Commissioner Duncan stated that typically these retention ponds are connected. City Engineer Greg Edrington advised that he has addressed this issue, and had the designers put a pipe for the overflow into the second area to allow the flow of water from one pond to another, as well as to allow for the pre-cleaning of the water. This will allow for the cleaning of the runoff before it gets into the detention pond. Staff Engineer advised that they have addressed all the drainage issues that he presented to his satisfaction.

Chairman Galbreath opened the floor for discussion. Jerry Garrett asked about the location of stairwells on the building. Mr. Williams stated that there were stairwells designed as areas of refuge on both ends of the building. Commissioner Duncan asked if these were the final plans, as they were not marked as such. Staff advised that these were not the final stamped plans for the project. Commissioner Duncan advised that he had concerns making decisions without the final documents before the Commission. Staff advised that the only issue that needed to be addressed tonight was the request for the reduction to 88 rooms.

Commissioner Duncan asked if it was based on parking and Staff advised that originally the site had more parking. Staff advised that at this time they were at the minimum amount of parking spaces. Chairman Galbreath questioned if that included the two spaces that will have to be removed for the fire department access to the southeast corner of the building. Staff advised that it did not, and they will have to make up for them elsewhere on the property. Mayor Combs requested information on the back side where a lighter shade of EIFS was being used. He asked that they consider using a darker color on the exterior of the building, so it would be visually appealing to the adjacent State Auto site. Mr. Williams stated that at this time they are looking for site plan approval and they have not presented the colors to Best Western for approval. Mayor Combs advised that he wanted the request for the color change only to be noted on the record at this time, as it will be addressed at a later date.

Mayor Combs requested clarification on the Best Western brand. Mr. Williams advised that Best Western Plus is the newest design model for the franchise, and the plus means that some of the rooms will be designated as extended stay. Due to the site constraints, only 88 rooms could be proposed and still stay within the brands design specifications. Mr. Williams advised that only 10% of the rooms are required to be extended stay, so at this site, there will only be 8 rooms.

Commissioner Duncan asked if the area on the southeastern side of the building could be designated as a tree buffer area, due to the large change in elevation, as well as being used to buffer the property from the adjacent site. Staff advised that even with pulling the retaining wall back to provide access for the fire department on the southeast corner of the building, there would still be about 20 feet to work with in regards to the landscaping. Mr. Williams stated that he will ask the landscape architect to look at that area, and determine what types conform to our landscape ordinance, as well as what type of trees will work and be sustainable for this area.

Mayor Combs requested the Planning Commission move forward with the consideration of the variance for the 88 rooms, so the project can move forward. Mayor Combs further advised that the City Commission is waiting for the Planning Commission to consider the 88 room request, before it moves forward with its decision. It was further re-iterated by Commissioner Duncan, that the 88 room request is in fact driven by the topography of the site.

Grady McNeil asked if a traffic study had been done for this site. Mr. Williams stated that it had not. Mr. McNeil stated that with the 40 mph speed limit on Conference Drive, it might be difficult to leave and gain access to the site with only one entrance. Commissioner Duncan stated that as close as the property is to Windsor Green Blvd traffic light, any additional traffic control devices might further hinder the passage of traffic on Conference Drive. Mr. Williams stated that they were very limited by the current cut in the median, to provide access to the site. Tony Espinosa asked for clarification on the on the two parts they were being asked to decide on during the current meeting. Mayor Combs stated that the 88 room reduction was the first aspect and the second was the conceptual design of the project.

Jerry Garrett requested they take a poll as to how many Commission Members were in favor of the 88 room request. David Lynn then asked what would occur if the variance is denied. Mr. Williams stated that it was reduced due the site's drainage and runoff requirements. As the plan stands now it shows the actual required rooms and parking spaces due to these requirements and the amount of employees that will be working on site. Mr. Williams stated that with such a challenging site, he wants to design it to the planning standards. Additionally with the request for fire department access to the southeast corner, he will have to relocate parking for that area, and if it must go to 90 rooms, that will be even more challenging for the site. Mr. Jim Hitt asked if there was a meeting room on the site, and how was that going to affect the parking? Mr. Williams stated that there was a meeting room, but it would only seat 15-

20 people. The room would not be rented out, it would be used by groups that would already be staying at the hotel. Mr. Hitt asked if they could possibly be too tight for the property and Mr. Williams stated that they thought the 88 room design was the best fit for the property.

Jim Driver asked if parking was a justifiable reason to issue a variance. Staff advised that the grade of the site, and the landscape requirements could be used for justification for the variance. Mayor Combs then made a conditional motion, that the 88 rooms be approved, with the condition that the Staff reviewed comments be fulfilled. Mr. Driver asked if they would still be able to review the future changes to the project. Addam McCormick advised he would bring back the revisions when they came in, and that additionally, Staff had to check with the fire department concerning their approval of the ladder access to the southeast corner. Mr. Jim Driver then seconded the motion made by Mayor Combs. The motion passed for the variance 10-1, with Chairman Galbreath voting against it.

Item #3 ***Copper Creek Section 2-Phase 4/Ragan Smith:*** Requests final subdivision plat approval for forty-seven (47) lots on Fall Creek Circle. Property is zoned MDRPUD, Medium Residential Planned Unit Development. Property is referenced as Sumner County Map 143, Parcels 22.10, 36.00, 36.01 and 37.00. Property Owner: Meritage Homes of Tennessee Inc. (9.1 13-16)

Jake Vincent represented Ragan Smith. Planning Director Addam McCormick stated the Master Plan for this phase had been approved in August 2016 and consist of forty-five (45) lots. He stated there were no comments on the final plat and it meets regulation requirements. He explained the bond process, and bond sheet showing line item break down of the improvements. Landscaping cost were left out on the improvement cost. Staff recommended adding $25,000 for landscape (street trees). He also explained that the improvement costs will be used to determine the subdivision bond amount at the time of the final plat recording, and completed improvements at the time of plat recording will be deducted except for a cost percentage associated with any construction damage. He discussed that the water utility (White House Utility District) administers their own bond program so the water improvement costs can be removed from the total improvement cost.
Based on staff recommendation and discussion, Jim Hitt made a motion to conditionally approve the request based on adding $25,000 to the bond amount for landscaping improvements. Mr. Jerry Garrett seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously, 11-0

Item #4 ***Copper Creek Section 2-Phase 3/Ragan Smith:*** Requests final subdivision plat approval for seventeen (17) lots on Sydney Drive. Property is zoned MDRPUD, Medium Density Residential Planned Unit Development. Property is referenced as Sumner County Map 143, Parcel 137. Property Owner: Meritage Homes of Tennessee Inc. (9.1 12-16)
Deferred from October 3rd Meeting

Jake Vincent represented Ragan Smith. Addam McCormick stated the Master Plan for this phase had been approved in July and consist of seventeen (17) lots on Sydney Drive. He stated there were no comments on the final plat and it meets the regulation requirements. He explained, as with the previous item #3, landscaping (street trees, buffer requirement) will need to be added and Staff recommended adding $20,000 to the bond amount for landscaping improvements. Based on Staff recommendation and discussion, Mr. David Lynn made a motion to conditionally approve the request based on adding $20,000 to the bond amount for landscaping improvements. Grady McNeal seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously, 11-0.

Item #5 ***Copper Creek Section 2 Phases 1 and 2/Meritage Homes of Tennessee Inc.:*** Request minor final master amendments regarding street tree landscaping planting location. (9.1 14-14 and 9.1 12-15)
Deferred from September 12th Meeting

Thomas Steffen represented Meritage Homes of Tennessee Inc. Addam McCormick reminded Board members that this discussion regarding street trees for Section 2 Phases 1-4 was deferred from the September 12th meeting. He explained that the Copper Creek Master plan for Section 2, Phases 1-4 include street trees at every lot line on both sides of the roadway and installed between the street curb and sidewalk (right of way). He said due to miscommunication, the trees were being installed behind the sidewalk and in the yards. At the meeting in September, Meritage Homes was given different options before moving forward with the placement of the remaining street trees. At the current meeting, Meritage Homes proposed to keep the street trees behind the sidewalk and front yard as they had started.
Mr. McCormick explained that the general idea if installed behind the sidewalk and off the public right of way, is to make sure it keeps the appearance of the street trees with maintenance and tree replacement when needed. He also noted that the natural gas line main design has changed and was relocated to be between the curb and sidewalk on one side of the street. He explained that Meritage Homes had submitted a homeowner's association covenant amendment to address the replacement of trees and to maintain street tree design. Staff discussed the placement of the trees. Trees will need to be installed behind the sidewalk and front yard and are to be ten (10 ft.) to fifteen (15ft) behind the sidewalk. Mr. Scott Trew and Mayor Coombs both agreed that this street tree placement seemed to be a better solution and suggested implementing it on future developments in the city.
Based on Staff comments and input from the developer, Scott Trew made a motion to conditionally approve the request based on the following:

*Recording of a revised homeowner association covenant

* Trees should be ten (10ft.) to fifteen (15ft.) behind the sidewalk to prevent conflicts with electric mains and maintain street tree design.

Tony Espinosa seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously 11-0.

Item #6 ***Bruce McCandless, Property Owner:*** Request approval for alternative exterior wall design for a proposed residential accessory building at 1155 Willis Branch Road. Property is zoned LDRPUD, Low Density Residential Planned Unit Development. Property is referenced as Sumner County Map 143F, Group a, Parcel 45 and contains 1.87 acres.
Deferred from October 3rd Meeting.

Property owner Bruce McCandless represented the request. Staff described the property for the proposed residential accessory building to be located at 1155 Willis Branch Rd. The property is zoned LDRPUD, Low Density Residential Planned Unit Development and it is the last house in the city limits. Mr. McCormick stated the house is 3,500 to 4,000 sq. ft. and 95% brick. Applicant is requesting to add an accessory building to the property. Staff reviewed the submitted drawings of the proposed building. Staff described it to be a 30 x 50 (1,500) sq. ft., with approximately a quarter of the building materials to be stone and the remainder vertical siding with a chocolate brown metal roof. Mr. Bruce McCandless discussed the renderings and presented examples of materials to be used for the building. He also discussed the proposed color pallet and design of the garage doors. Staff reviewed the current ordinance regarding accessory buildings having to match the materials of the principle structure (house), and noted that the majority of Mr. McCandless' house is brick but he is wanting to use an alternative design for budget purposes. Commissioner Duncan and Tony Espinosa both agreed that Mr. McCandless had presented a quality plan for the building and a pleasing look to complement his home and surrounding properties.
Chairman Galbreath asked Staff for clarification on what the Planning Commission is to determine, building materials and color? Mr. McCormick stated the building material (alternative) is the request before them, based on the current zoning ordinance stating:

> ***An accessory building or structures in residential districts which exceed three hundred seventy-five (375) square feet shall be constructed of roof and exterior wall materials consistent with the primary roof and exterior wall materials of the principle building or structure.***

Mr. McCormick said Mr. McCandless is requesting to use alternative materials for the building and roof and the decision is if the materials are of equivalent level of quality. Staff also stated that accessory building design is sometimes challenging for homeowners based on the current zoning requirements. After discussion and presentation, Mr. Jim Driver made a motion to approve the request based on the quality of materials proposed to be used. Mr. Bob Whittaker seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously, 11-0.

Item #7 ***Zoning ordinance Amendment/Planning and Development Services Staff:*** Request recommendation to the City Commission to amend the Zoning Ordinance Section14-209 Floodplain Districts to incorporate updated Davidson County Flood Insurance Rate Maps (FIRM) and Flood Insurance Study report (FIS) set to be effective April 5, 2017.

Staff reviewed. Mr. McCormick discussed and presented the new Davidson County FEMA Flood Insurance Rate Maps (FIRM). The new maps will be effective April 5, 2017. He discussed areas of Goodlettsville that are affected by the new maps. Staff calculated approximately thirty-five (35) properties in the Janette Ave/Gateway area that will be included in a designated floodway district which will increase flood insurance rates for property owners. He discussed other property changes of the new flood maps which included:

A few properties in the Windsor Green Development
Both sections of Hitt Lane
Areas of French/Memorial Street

Staff stated the City is required by State Law to be in the National Flood Insurance Program, and it is necessary to adopt the new referenced flood maps. Staff informed Board Members of a website, http://maps.nashville.gov/PrelimFEMAViewer/#
He stated the web-site is very helpful in reviewing the difference between the current and new maps. Mayor Coombs asked Staff to inquire if any type of funding from Metro is available to assist Goodlettsville residents which will be affected by the flood map changes. City Engineer Greg Edrington stated that with the new flood maps, future plans for drainage around the City Hall area need to be considered. Planning Commission and Staff discussed Master drainage plans and possible future drainage needs of the City.
Based on Staff recommendations and discussion, Jerry Garrett made a motion to approve to amend the Zoning Ordinance Section 14-209 and move forward to the City Commission. Jim Hitt seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously 11-0.

Item #8 ***Zoning Ordinance Amendment/Planning and Development Services Staff:*** Requests recommendation to the City Commission to amend the Zoning Ordinance Section 14-208 Supplementary District Regulations to incorporate temporary family healthcare structures in single family residential zoning districts.

Staff reviewed. Addam McCormick stated Staff had received a request from resident inquiring about options for a temporary living quarter to be installed on her property on Brick Church Pike. He explained that the temporary unit request is to provide living quarters for a sick elderly family member or the caregivers because they simply needed more room. The applicant had asked about moving in a single wide mobile home, but zoning on the property only allowed one single family dwelling. Staff then explained the State Law that recently passed regarding Temporary Family Healthcare Structures.
He gave some idea of how the temporary family medical quarters are defined and discussed the State Law:
Staff then presented and discussed a proposed ordinance amendment based on the new State Law:

Planning Commission members and Staff discussed the proposed ordinance amendment and considered the need for this type of temporary structure and how it could be beneficial for the applicant's need as well as other residents. They had questions and concerns and ask Staff to work on defining some areas of the ordinance including:
Enforcement of the structure (termination and removal)
Issuance of permits for the structure (1year)
Defined location of the structure on the property
After discussion, Commissioner Jeff Duncan made a motion to defer the request by Staff to amend the Zoning Ordinance to incorporate temporary family healthcare structures in single family residential zoning districts. Mr. Jim Driver seconded the motion. The motion passed 9-0 with Bob Whittaker and Scott Trew voting against deferring the item.

Discussion Items:

TDOT I-65 Corridor Study Project

Staff discussed TDOT's Corridor Study Project and items that City Staff submitted to be included in the study. Staff encouraged Members to participate in the I-65 Corridor public survey. It may be completed www.surveymonkey.com/r/I65survey

Members discussed, and Greg Edrington stated that the City has requested a traffic safety audit for exits 96, 97, and 98 and are hoping to get feedback shortly.

Sumner County Planners Fall Training Seminar

Staff noted that the revised date for the Sumner County Planners Fall Training seminar is Tuesday November 28, 2016 at Hendersonville Library and time TBD. The seminar is planned to cover the four (4) hour annual training state requirement. Mr. McCormick also discussed another option for training requirements is to attend a Metro Nashville Planning Commission Meeting and review their review and approval process.

The meeting adjourned at 7:00 p.m.

Jim Galbreath, Chairman

Rhonda Carson, ECD Assistant