

OFFICIAL MINUTES OF THE MEETING
GOODLETTSVILLE PLANNING COMMISSION

May 6, 2024

Goodlettsville City Hall

5:00 p.m.

Massie Chambers-Auditorium

Present: Chairman Scott Trew, Jeff Duncan, Cisco Gilmore, Grady McNeal, Jeff Parnell, Mayor Rusty Tinnin, and Judy Wheeler.

Absent: None

Also Present: Addam McCormick (Staff), Tim Ellis-City Manager, Russell Freeman-City Attorney, Jenni Lester (Staff), and Sharon Reed (Staff).

Scott Trew called the meeting to order and McNeal offered prayer.

Item #1 Approval of Agenda: Tinnin made a motion to approve the agenda, Wheeler seconded the motion. The motion passed.

Item #2 Approval of April 1, 2024 Meeting Minutes: Gilmore made a motion to approve the minutes of the April 1, 2024 meeting, Parnell seconded the motion. Duncan abstained since he was absent the meeting. The motion passed.

Item #3 Trew opened the Public Forum on Planning Related Topics.

Jesse Walker-104 Dorr Drive

Walker discussed his support for agenda item #5 the Rivergate Mixed Use project. He thinks it will revitalize the Rivergate and Madison area. He supports the project.

Patrick Adams-827 Long Hollow Pike

Adams commented he is against agenda item #4 Long Hollow Pike Rezone. Adams commented he did not think adding twenty-four (24) units in the area would benefit anyone and the traffic along Long Hollow Pike is bad enough.

Genevieve Kephart-815 Long Hollow Pike

Kephart commented she is in opposition to agenda item #4 Long Hollow Pike Rezone. Kephart commented that she has lived at this address for twenty (20) years and the traffic is already insane on Long Hollow Pike. In her opinion building a multi-unit complex will not benefit the community.

Tracy Graves-Dillard's Rivergate Mall, Store Manager

Graves commented they are in support of item #5 the Rivergate Mixed Use project. Graves commented since BJ's has been open it has helped their business with more foot traffic and are looking forward to the Rivergate Mixed Use project.

Trew asked for any additional comments and no additional comments were received.

Tinnin made a motion to close the public forum, seconded by Parnell. The motion passed unanimously.

The Public Forum was closed.

AGENDA

Item #4 Long Hollow Pike Rezone/ Green LID Design: Requests recommendation to the City Commission to amend the Zoning Map from R40, Low Density Residential to HDRPUD, High Density Residential Planned Unit Development and preliminary master plan for twenty (20) attached residential units and one detached residential unit on 3.9 acres at 775 Long Hollow Pike. Property Owners: Lindsey and Johnathan Runion (5-24) (Deferred at April 1, 2024 Meeting)

Item Representative: John Runion, Property Owner and Brock Rust

Staff Discussion:

- The agenda item was deferred at the March and April meetings.
- The revised plan includes twenty (20) attached residential units and a loop roadway design.
- The building unit square footage proposal is 672 square feet per unit.
- The project includes thirty (36) parking spaces for twenty (20) units for 1.8 parking space per unit.
- The request is for a reduced parking ratio from the requirement of two (2) spaces per unit.
- The applicant's request for reduced parking is based on the proposed age group intended for the residential units.
- Revised building design photo samples were submitted, and a project design video link was provided.
- The water utility service commitment letter was provided but a sewer service letter has not been provided.
- If the preliminary master plan is approved, the sewer service letter would need to be provided with City Commission review.
- Staff discussed the proposed design with TDOT, Tennessee Department of Transportation representatives.
- The TDOT reps have requested the project access be from Long Hollow Pike/SR 174 due to their concerns with the limited separation distance from the intersection of Willis Branch Road/Long Hollow Pike and the parallel driveway connection.
- If the preliminary master plan is approved, a revised plan showing connection to Long Hollow Pike will need to be provided with the City Commission review.
- TDOT reps also requested the existing shared driveway connect into the main project access drive design and ensure easements are in place for the shared access.
- Staff Stipulation-Provide sewer utility service commitment letter to be submitted with City Commission review.
- Staff Stipulation-Minimum building materials- per building photo examples provided by applicant includes a minimum eighty-five (85) percent brick or stone on building with remaining materials including EIFS or cement fiber board siding. The examples provided will define the architectural requirements for the proposed buildings.
- Staff Stipulation- Project buffer- Review if north side buffer could be increased from five (5') feet to ten (10') feet. If preliminary master plan is approved, at final master plan will need to determine landscaping/solid fencing options depending on available buffer widths.
- Staff Stipulation-Revise plans per TDOT review with main access at the Long Hollow Pike/SR 174 connection with adjacent shared driveway connected into the main project drive with applicable easement.

- Staff Stipulation-Restrictive covenants/homeowner association guidelines. Per previous meeting discussion the project is intended to be a for sale product. If preliminary master plan is approved, provide covenants and guideline information with final master plan submittal.
- Motion Option-Recommend approval to the City Commission to rezone the property to HDRPUD, High Density Residential Planned Unit Development and preliminary master plan approval to include staff stipulations and other items determined by the Planning Commission during the meeting discussion.
- Staff recommendation presented due to revisions per previous Planning Commission discussion.
- Motion Option-Recommend denial to the City Commission to maintain the property zoning as R-40, Low Density Residential.
- Motion Option-Deferral to include any additional information as determined by the Planning Commission during the meeting discussion.

Planning Commission Discussion:

- Rust discussed the changes to last month's plan by decreasing the number of units and now have the required number of parking spaces.
- Rust discussed the parking area against the buildings so they do not have to walk an extended distance.
- Rust discussed the landscaping buffers and the one-way travel lane.
- Rust discussed the units being owned with a minimum age requirement of sixty-two (62) and it will have an HOA.
- McCormick commented if this goes forward at the final, they would need to review the HOA covenant guidelines.
- Duncan has concerns with the roadway slopes, handicap parking cross slope and elevations.
- Rust responded and discussed the slope grade, and plans for the roadway.
- Duncan commented his concern is he does not think they will get the quality development on this narrow lot and slopes.
- Gilmore has concerns about the units being rented or individual deeded units and if they did not sell.
- McCormick responded the City does not enforce private deed restrictions so they would need to review the HOA covenant if this goes forward.
- Rust responded and discussed regulations and restriction percentages regarding someone renting their home.
- Parnell discussed the development as being owned by an investor and leasing the units for the sixty-two (62) and older population.
- Duncan commented he agrees with Parnell and discussed the request for High Density Residential Planned Development.
- Tinnin asked what the square footage for the units without the upstairs is.
- Rust responded six hundred and seventy-two (672) square feet.
- Wheeler questioned why the age changed from fifty-five (55) and up to sixty-two (62) and up.
- Rust responded fifty-five (55) is a legislated number with rules and regulations and sixty-two (62) is a non-legislated number with no rules or regulations.
- Trew asked for clarification on the entrance to the property.
- McCormick responded TDOT requests the main access be from Long Hollow Pike.
- Runion discussed the development being affordable housing for the end user and replicate what has already been successful in Cottage Grove.
- Parnell discussed the elevations, a road in the center, hammerhead turnarounds, and the number of units.

Motion: Motion by Duncan to recommend denial to the City Commission to maintain the property zoning as R-40, Low Density Residential. No second.

Motion: Motion by Parnell to approve with the stipulations (1) Remove the access onto Willow Branch and main connection directly to Long Hollow Pike, (2) Variance for side set-backs to be thirty-five (35') feet, (3) Limitation of density to twenty (20) units and the one (1) existing house on the property, (4) Consideration of a single drive isle in the center with fire hammerhead turnaround in the front and back. No second.

Motion: Motion by Parnell to defer the request, seconded by McNeal.

-Duncan commented it has been deferred twice already.

-Ellis asked when this comes back are they expecting certain changes or what are they coming back for?

-Parnell responded if the members of the board can see the redesign with additional information regarding the slopes the visualization might help assist.

The motion passed with six (6) yes votes and one (1) no vote.

Item #5 1000C Rivergate Mixed Use/ Smith Gee Studio: Request recommendation to the City Commission to amend the Zoning Map from CSL, Commercial Services Limited to RC1, Regional Center Planned Unit Development and preliminary master plan approval for 340 multi-family residential units, 17,000 sq.ft. of commercial use space, and a 60,000 sq.ft. hotel on 11.82 Acres on Rivergate Parkway. Properties referenced as Davidson County Tax Map/Parcel# 02614002400 and 02614003100. Property Owner: MRH Rivergate LLC (7-24)

Item Representative: Scott Morton, Smith Gee Studio and Kate Jarosh, AL Neyer

Staff Discussion:

-The project includes 340 residential units and commercial development including 77,000 square feet of commercial with 17,000 square feet commercial space and 60,000 square feet in the proposed 120 room hotel.

-The proposal is based on the City's 2020 Comprehensive Land Use Plan revision for the Rivergate Mall area as a regional mixed-use center.

-The proposal is for 510 parking spaces/1.5 parking spaces per unit.

-The City's parking requirement would be 581 parking spaces based on the bedroom unit breakdown.

-Ellis commented since the closing of Macy's there have been three (3) other mixed-use developments projects that was not that right time or was not the right development for this site. Since meeting and working with the AL Neyer group they are partnering with Smith Gee Studios and in his opinion one of the top architectural firms in Nashville for mixed use developments.

-Ellis discussed the proposal for high density housing and the proposed development.

-The project includes the demolition of the former Macy's building that is connected to the Rivergate mall building.

-The preliminary master plan includes renderings of the proposed buildings.

-The project designs will be required to meet the City's Design Guidelines.

-The one level commercial projects will need to be designed to have the appearance of larger height two (2) story buildings to meet the streetscape design intended with Regional Center developments.

-The building designs could include different design options for an increased height appearance with a one-story use.

-The project proposal includes 340 residential units including 197- one bedroom and 143- two (2) bedroom units.

- The City has reviewed and approved similar reduced parking requirements for larger scale residential developments in a mixed use setting with preliminary master plan review process.
- Staff Stipulation-City Fire Marshal and Fire Department requests a twenty-six (26') feet width access drive provided from private Rivergate Parkway drive connection between the proposed hotel and commercial building connecting to the twenty-six (26') feet drive behind the proposed buildings adjacent to the existing mall building.
- Staff Stipulation-All building designs including residential buildings, hotel, and commercial outbuildings to meet the City's Design Guidelines. If the preliminary master plan is approved, the building formal designs to be submitted with a final master plan process including materials and color requirements.
- Staff Stipulation-Commercial outbuildings to be designed to meet streetscape design increased building height similar to a two (2) story building. If the preliminary master plan is approved the commercial outbuilding designs to be submitted with the final master plan process including materials and color requirements and designs to be similar to the building height of two (2) story buildings.
- Staff Stipulation-Adjacent mall building and parking designs. If preliminary master plan is approved the design of the revised mall building exterior design and disconnected adjacent parking lot connections to be finalized including written letter from the adjacent property owners. The intention is for the usability of the adjacent mall building and adjacent parking spaces next to the disconnected project parking boundary.
- Staff Stipulation-Rivergate Parkway traffic signal and turn lane review. If preliminary master plan is approved, provide with final master plan a traffic study to determine any traffic signal or turn lane alterations needed.
- Motion Option-Recommend approval to the City Commission to rezone the property to RC1, Regional Center Planned Unit Development and preliminary master plan approval to include staff stipulations and other items determined by the Planning Commission during the meeting discussion. The rezoning approval is based on the City's Comprehensive Land Use plan. Staff Recommendation presented
- Motion Option-Recommend denial to the City Commission to maintain the property zoning as CSL, Commercial Services Limited
- Motion Option-Deferral to include any additional information as determined by the Planning Commission during the meeting discussion.

Planning Commission Discussion:

- Morton stated that they plan to meet the expectations of the City and the community and the needs of the community with high quality architecture.
- Morton discussed the vision for the development to include active retail, hotel, and residential uses.
- Morton discussed revitalizing the developments area with many amenities, greenspace, dining establishments and commercial areas.
- Morton stated they greatly appreciate working with staff and are comfortable with the staff stipulations and ready to move forward working with the different agencies and remaining conditions.
- Duncan discussed the streetscape design merging with the main street project continuing to develop the next parcels and will be a great addition if they move it forward to other properties
- Duncan discussed the need for meeting space in Goodlettsville.
- Trew commented he has heard all positive comments and is excited about the development.
- Wheeler asked if Smith Gee and Al Neyer have partnered together in this type of extensive development in other areas?
- Morton responded this is their first opportunity to partner with Al Neyer.
- Tinnin discussed the need for meeting space/convention center in Goodlettsville and excited about the high quality proposed development.

- Parnell discussed the need for restaurants in the retail space area and possible options to limit use to a restaurant in the commercial space.
- Jarosh responded it is a mixed-use development and their goal is to have a restaurant.
- Parnell has concern with the design separation from the mall.
- Morton responded and explained the ownership status of the mall, and future tenants of the mall.
- Ellis commented he understands some of the concern, but he would encourage them to move forward with the development.

Motion: Motion by Tinnin to approve with the five (5) stipulations outlined by staff, seconded by Gilmore. The motion passed unanimously.

Item #6 Stone Bridge Lots/Holladay Ventures: Request final master plan revision approval for revised site grading design and landscaping improvements for 311 multi-family apartment units and 6,000 sq. ft. of commercial space on 19.22 acres at 619 N. Main Street/ Hwy 41/SR-11. The property is zoned HDRPUD, High Density Residential Planned Unit Development and referenced as Davidson County Tax Map/Parcel# 01812006900. Property Owner: Stone Bridge Lofts Condominiums (# 12-20)

Item Representative: Evan Holladay, Holladay Ventures

Staff Discussion:

- The proposal is to change the site grading and landscaping design at the back of the site adjacent to CSX railroad tracks.
- The Planning Commission previously approved a revised site grading and landscaping design with a retaining wall along the rear property boundary.
- Multiple sections of the stacked retaining wall failed after installation due to soil issues.
- The revised proposal is to maintain a section of the retaining wall and regrade the remaining area.
- A smaller height retaining wall is proposed up the slope with the revised design to maintain a 3:1 designed slope for stability and landscaping.
- The revised retaining wall section is adjacent to the project utility access drive.
- The revised landscaping plan has been provided including revised planting to maximize the slope stability design.
- The City's engineer consultant reviewed the revised plan and requested a correction on the plan to ensure the 3:1 slope and the owner provide a Geotech study to confirm the slope stability design plan.
- Staff Stipulation-Revised plan to meet City's engineer consultant comments about correct designed slope and Geotech study confirmation.
- Motion Option-Approve site plan with listed staff stipulation including any additional items determined by the Planning Commission. Staff recommendation presented
- Motion Option-Defer request to include additional information as determined by the Planning Commission that requires additional review by the Planning Commission.
- Motion Option-Denial of revised site plan as determined by the Planning Commission

Planning Commission Discussion:

- Holladay discussed the failure of the wall and going back to the original approved site plan.
- Duncan discussed the wall failure and construction issue and concerns with design changes due to a construction installation issue.
- Holladay responded it was an unfortunate event that happened, but they feel they have a better natural outcome with the 3:1 slope and landscaping.

- Freeman discussed the fencing on the new wall.
- Holladay responded there will be fencing on all portions of the wall for safety.

Motion: Motion by Duncan to approve with the one (1) stipulation outlined by staff, seconded by Tinnin. The motion passed unanimously.

Item #7 Echo Hills Estates Master Plan/Forestar Communities: Requests extension of April 5, 2021 approval of final master /construction plans for phase five (5) and phase six (6) including sixty-one (61) single family home lots on 18.7 acres on Solitude Circle. Property referenced as Davidson County Tax Map/Parcel 03300002900 and is zoned LDRPUD, Low Density Residential Planned Unit Development. Property Owner-Vista Land Co, LLC (# 07-19)

Item Representative: Wayne Miller, Four Star Group

Staff Discussion:

- The request is to extend the April 5, 2021 Planning Commission approval including the defined stipulations of the Echo Hills Subdivision phase five (5) and phase six (6) construction plans.
- The new owner/developer has hired a new engineering firm.
- The engineering firm will be redrawing the plans and any major changes between the plans will be required to be reviewed by the Planning Commission.
- Since no grading or building permits were obtained by the previous owner per defined State of Tennessee vested plan approval rights, the Planning Commission's 2021 plan approval has expired.
- Planning Commission approved staff stipulations from the April 5, 2021 meeting minutes:
- Staff Stipulation-City's Engineer consultant review of revised drainage calculations.
- Staff Stipulation-Additional design information including headwalls and support calculations needed for the twenty-four (24") outlet pipe shown on lot 117 connecting the drainage flow from ditch behind lots 109-117 to detention pond in phase six (6).
- Staff Stipulation-Label entry slope Solitude Court at intersection (revised grade but slope% not labeled).
- Staff Stipulation-Fire hydrant to be within 600' feet of all houses on Solitude Way other hydrant locations labeled in phases five (5) and six (6).
- Motion Option-Approve the April 5, 2021 construction plan approval with previous defined stipulations and notation that revised plans to meet current storm water ordinance requirements. Staff recommendation presented.
- Motion Option-Deny the extended construction plan approval request.
- Motion Option-Defer request to include additional information as determined by the Planning Commission.

Planning Commission Discussion:

- Trew asked McCormick how long the extension will be.
- McCormick responded with this approval two (2) years, and summarized the State of Tennessee vested right law.

Motion: Motion by Tinnin to approve with the previous defined stipulations and notation that the revised plans to meet current storm water ordinance requirements, seconded by Wheeler. The motion passed unanimously.

Item #8 Community Development Services Staff: Requests recommendation to the City Commission to amend the Zoning Ordinance Section 14-209 (3)(B) to reference the FEMA, Federal Emergency Management Agency- National Flood Insurance Program revised Flood Insurance Study (FIS) dated June 20, 2024 and revised Flood Insurance Rate Map (FIRM) panels 47037C0137K and 47037C0136J dated June 20, 2024.

Item Representative: Addam McCormick, Staff

Staff Discussion:

- FEMA has finalized two (2) updated flood map panels including the city limit areas and updated the flood study/stream cross section documents.
- FEMA representatives have discussed possible additional flood zone regulation amendments, but no revised regulations have been provided.
- City staff is requesting to reduce the previous City amended requirement to reduce the minimum floor elevation for non-residential buildings from two (2') feet above the base flood to one (1') foot.
- The City previously extended the State model ordinance for a non-residential building minimum elevation above the FEMA base flood information from one (1') to two (2') feet.
- The minimum elevation would only be applicable within designated floodways and floodplains.
- The City previously increased the minimum elevation but has determined this has created some issues with commercial sites and building redevelopments.
- The City is required to adopt the amendments by June 20th to be compliant with FEMA guidelines.
- The City Commission will be voting at the May and June meetings to adopt the listed amendments.
- Any additional FEMA provided regulations will be included in the City Commission review and will be discussed at the June Planning Commission meeting.
- Staff presented the Existing Zoning Ordinance Sections: 14-209 (3)(a), 14-209 (5)(b)(ii), and Proposed Zoning Ordinance Amendments: 14-209 (3)(a)(Amendment), 14-209 (5)(b)(ii)(Amendment)
- Motion Option-Recommend approval to the City Commission to approve the amendments. Staff recommendation presented.
- Motion Option-Request additional information as determined by the Planning Commission for review at June Planning Commission meeting for an amendment to the May approval.

Planning Commission Discussion: No Discussion

Motion: Motion by Parnell to approve the request, seconded by Duncan. The motion passed unanimously.

Item #9 Community Development Services Staff: Request recommendation to the City Commission to amend the Design Guidelines to include prohibited types of exterior building and site lighting.

Item Representative: Addam McCormick, Staff

Staff Discussion:

- A Planning Commissioner requested staff review exterior lighting requirements due to concerns with site and building lighting including bright colored lights.
- The City's Design Guidelines do not define prohibited designs.
- The proposed amendment includes defining the maximum Kelvin scale light design measurement regarding the color temperature and defined designs for brighter or colored lights.

- The Kelvin color temperature scale measures the color temperature of light sources.
- Staff presented a Proposed Amendment to the Design Guidelines Lighting Section.
- Motion Option-Recommend approval to the City Commission for the Design Guideline amendment. Staff recommendation presented.
- Motion Option-Recommend denial of the Design Guideline amendment.
- Motion Option-Deferral to include additional information as determined by Planning Commission at the meeting.

Planning Commission Discussion:

- Duncan commented he asked Mr. McCormick to research this due to the color and bright lights around the City being used for area light.
- Parnell asked for clarification is this a design guideline or a City code?
- McCormick responded and explained it is a design guideline
- Duncan discussed LED lighting features.
- McCormick responded this would only apply to commercial and not in a single-family neighborhoods.
- McCormick stated he could do research for residential lighting.

Motion: Motion by Duncan to approve the request, seconded by Gilmore. The motion passed unanimously.

Tinnin commented concerned citizens have asked about the temporary Vape shop signs in front of the plaza and asked McCormick if they are legal?

McCormick responded they have timelines for temporary signs.

Tinnin asked if the enforcement code for temporary signs could be modified?

McCormick responded he would draft some provisions.

With no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 7:09 pm.

Scott Trew, Chairman

Sharon Reed, Planning Assistant